

# WID Information

<http://www.uiuc.edu/providers/ips/wid.html>

April, 1999. Volume 19 (4). Office of Women in International Development. University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

## RESEARCH NOTES

### In the Shadow: Women, Gender, and Public Administration in Indonesia

By Isabel Dale Silver, Ph.D.

#### Introduction

The state bureaucracy plays a particularly important role in developing countries like Indonesia. Most studies of state bureaucracy and public administration, however, including those of Indonesia, are gender blind. Bringing women public administrators onto center stage is necessary not only to assess their position in that sector but also to identify how public



*The Sultan of Yogyakarta and family. Modern public administration in Indonesia flows directly from the patrimonial Javanese court culture*

*More on Indonesia on page 3*

## AN ALUMNA'S GREETINGS

by Suja George, Ph.D.



After receiving my Master's Degree in Human Development and Family Studies and Gender Roles in International Development (GRID) concentration from the University of Illinois, I worked for the Administrative Office of the Illinois Courts for two years, assisting chief judges coordinate local family violence councils. Convened by the

chief judges, the councils use an interdisciplinary approach to ending family violence in communities. Diverse groups of professionals participate in the councils, including police officers, educators, social workers, judges, attorneys, clergy, health care professionals, etc. After my work with the Illinois Courts, I returned to the University of Illinois to do my doctoral work. Using my experiences coordinating family violence councils, I focused my dissertation on the construction of domestic violence among police officers. I demonstrated how police officers' interpretation of violence was influenced by their personal lived experiences, the culture of law enforcement, prejudices, and training. Moreover, I demonstrated how their interpretations of domestic violence affected how they responded to victims and perpetrators.

Currently, I am working for the Illinois Violence Prevention Authority (IVPA) in Chicago. IVPA was estab-

*More on Suja George on page 2*

## SEVENTEENTH ANNUAL STUDENT PAPER COMPETITION

The Office of Women in International Development announces its Annual Student Paper Competition, with two awards of \$100.00 each for the winning graduate and undergraduate papers. Papers should focus on gender issues in the context of international development. **Eligibility:** Graduate and undergraduate students at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign may submit papers. Papers from all disciplines will be accepted. **Guidelines:** Papers should be typewritten, double-spaced, and prepared in a journal format acceptable to the student's major discipline. Papers should not exceed 30 pages in length. Please indicate graduate or undergraduate and include Summer telephone contact or address.

**Submission Deadline:** Monday, May 17, 1999. The winners will be publicly announced September 1999.

Paper should be submitted to: Office of Women in International Development, 320 International Studies Building, 910 South Fifth Street, Champaign, IL 61820. For additional information, contact: Aida Orgocka (244-1722) or Kathy Martin (333-1994).



## WID ACTIVITIES AT UI

**le Summerfield**, director, organized two sessions for the Eastern Economic Association Meetings in Boston, March 14, 1999 on: "What's Working? Women's Strategies and Policies During Economic Transformation." In addition to a paper with Nahid Aslanbeigui and Steve Pressman, the following people presented papers: Rae Lesser Blumberg, University of Virginia and Univ. of California at San Diego; **Ary Arends-Kuening**, UI, with Sajeda Amin, Population Council; Radhika Murthy, Institute for Women's Policy Search; **Rosintan Panjaitan**, UI; Barbara Hopkins, Wright State University. A related session was presented at Allied Social Sciences Association meetings in New York in January 1999 in preparation for the sequel to *Women in the Age of Economic Transformation* that Nahid, Arends-Kuening and Gale are editing.

**WID Office is sponsoring a talk by Dr. David Cocker**, Univ. of Maryland, on "Consumption, Capability, and Development: The Cases of Costa Rica and Honduras" 7:30 pm, Wed. April 14, Reading Room of the Levis Faculty Center.

**WID Executive Committee member, Marianne Ferber**, coached hats for the day on February 28 and became assistant coach for the women's basketball team at UI. The team issued the invitation to honor Marianne's years of outstanding contributions to the academic community. The team has gone on to the playoffs and Marianne has returned to her writing and swimming.

**Annual WID Spring Reception** will be honoring and celebrating graduates of the GRID concentration program: **Armen Vergara**, Mexico, Human and Community Development; **Elsa Beatriz Padilla**, Argentina, Department of Sociology; and **Vrinda Deva**, India, Labor and Industrial Relations. The reception will be held May 7, 1999, 4:00-6:00 pm, Room 314, International Studies Building.

*George from page 1*

inspired by the Illinois Violence Prevention Act of 1995 to plan, coordinate, fund, and evaluate public health and safety approaches to violence prevention in the state. It is the first activity of its kind in the United States. The initial funding for community based efforts was generated from the sale of specially designed Prevent Violence (PV) License Plates. A portion of the sales of PV license plates goes to fund violence prevention efforts in Illinois.

Within IVPA, I am coordinating the Safe Illinois Project. This project is a partnership between public and private agencies

that are committed to preventing intimate partner violence. In addition to IVPA, some of the other major partners in the collaboration include: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Illinois Department of Public Health, University of Illinois at Chicago, and a major managed care organization, Blue Cross Blue Shield of Illinois. The goals of the Safe Illinois Project are the following: (1) to develop a model of delivering intimate partner violence prevention and intervention services within the workplace and health care settings, (2) to implement the model in three Illinois sites; (3) to evaluate the effectiveness of the model, and (4) to replicate the successes in other sites.

### How being a WID Associate contributed to my present view of Domestic Violence

My experience of being a WID associate has immensely enriched my graduate school experiences. The WID program exposed me to diverse classes in Rural Sociology, Women's Studies, and Anthropology, and to students and scholars from around the world. In regard to my research and work experiences, WID encouraged me to view domestic violence as an international issue affecting women in every culture and society, as a basic violation of human rights, and as preventable.

Interestingly, I learned that as cultures and communities varied, so did the solutions to violence. Some communities depended greatly on the government and professional groups (i.e., police officers and social service agencies) to intervene in cases, while other communities relied heavily on small, grassroots organizations composed of women with very little resources. Some strategies were effective in some circumstances, and there was great value in sharing and celebrating these innovative and effective strategies with the larger community.

Finally, in reflecting on my experiences as a WID associate, what seems more valuable than what I learned (and I have learned much) is the close friendships that I have developed with international scholars and students. Jean Peterson, Kate Cloud, and Brenda Eheart are just a couple of examples of intelligent women with amazing strength, dedication, and courage. Not only did they share their knowledge and skills, but they shared their personal experiences, their vision for women and children around the world, and at times, their tears. I am inspired by them and feel fortunate to have them mentor me.

In addition to the academic challenges, GRID provided a unique setting for students from diverse backgrounds to meet and form life-long friendships. What I remember fondly and vividly are the 15-hour van rides to AWID conferences, the ethnic potluck dinners and surprise birthday parties, the long discussions about cultural differences and similar female experiences, and the exciting and stimulating discussions about the future of our nations, families and individuals. I am grateful for the GRID program for providing a setting for these priceless and inspiring memories.

*Indonesia from page 1*

bureaucracies advance or stifle the circumstances of living for women in general. This study draws Indonesian female public officials out of the shadow and offers a gender perspective on the operation of one of the world's largest public bureaucracies.

This exploratory case study examines the changing status of public administrators under the New Order political regime (1966-1998). The case of Indonesia's civil service is framed within the multiple contexts of the relationship between women and the state, gender in the Indonesian state, Indonesia's unique political history and culture, and the organizational culture of Indonesia's public administration. The basic problem for women, public administration, and society is women's under representation and subordination at the managerial and policy-making levels. This is significant given the enormous influence of the autocratic New Order bureaucracy over a weak civil society.

### Data Collection and Findings

Data collection involved a two-step research approach. Employment data drawn from the Central Bureau of Statistics were collected to construct a profile of women's participation and vertical and horizontal position in 1974, 1984, and 1994. Despite the enormous expansion of women into the middle ranks of the civil service, gender inequality in the New Order regime persists amidst governmental proclamations of gender equality and formal efforts to establish *de jure* equality. Women's participation declines as position level rises. A gender ceiling blocks the highest of four wage ranks and excludes women from the highest leadership levels in the professional, line management, echelon classification system. Analysis of women's distribution in the ministries and agencies of the central government shows that occupational segregation by gender also prevails. This profile indicates the persistence of gender barriers that prevent Indonesian women from equal participation in the public decision-making of their societies.

Based on this profile, two research questions then were explored through semi-structured interviews with 23 male and female public administration professionals (13 women and 10 men). One research question asks how professional men and women in public sector workplaces perceive their work experiences. The second question asks how the organizational culture of the Indonesian public bureaucracy sustains the exclusion of women from management and sustains the entitlements of men.

Interview findings support the profile of women occupying a subordinate position in Indonesia's public administration. In addition, male and female public officials revealed different experiences at work and different perceptions of those experiences. While both stipulated that gender difference did not come into play in work experiences, the women officials expressed that they needed "to work harder and do better" than

their male colleagues if they ever hoped to achieve promotion. The women interviewees also recognized a definite "glass ceiling" while the men rejected this concept. Although women have made some inroads into public management, interview data portray a gender system that disadvantages women. Both workplace practices and organizational culture perpetuate the gender ceiling.

Several major findings from the interview research include,



*A mid-level woman public official*

first, work practices of promotions based on personal relations and political appointments rather than merit and performance; the restricted distribution and availability of job opportunities, training, and perks; and extended work schedules, travel, and training requirements that all disadvantage women. Second, the organization is structured according to a family gender system, based on a gender ideology derived from culture and religion, locating men and women in complementary roles with women as wives and men as leaders/breadwinners. This is especially epitomized by the bureaucracy's *Dharma Wanita* ("Lady's Duty") organization and the mandatory membership of all wives of civil servants, structured in its hierarchy according to their husband's status. Wives of civil servants are required "without exception" by the New Order government to "serve as a loyal partner and comrade-in-arms" to the government in addition to their other personal and employment responsibilities. The public administration's family gender system is further reinforced by its acceptance of the dual work burden for working women, granting them flexible work schedules while simultaneously casualizing them as workers.

Third, there exists a prevailing system of gender contradictions so that public officials, male and female, claim that gender equality is an accomplished fact while simultaneously describing, and ascribing to, a system of male privilege and female subordination. Interviewees consistently contended that gender biases do not operate in the workplace while supplying descriptions of clearly defined familial gender roles including the dual work burden of women, stratified gender relationships, negative stereotypes of women bosses despite the positive stereotypes of women workers, and the ensuing assumption that women cannot fulfill the demands of leadership in the public bureaucracy. The consensus among the interviewees was that there is no discrimination against individual women *except that* they must work harder, better, and

*More on Indonesia page 4*





A business lunch with a young visitor

longer to be promoted over less-productive men. That women must be far superior to the male competition is a fact of life accepted by the female public officials and that, all things being equal, the male candidate will always get the job over the female.

Finally, interview data show a marked gender bias against female leadership in general and women bosses in particular. For example, interviewees expressed that if women do not have equality as defined by an equal representation in the highest leadership positions, then this is "not to be anyway." Essentially, equality in leadership is considered either not necessary, not possible, not proper, or irrelevant owing to the belief that female leadership would not change anything. Another example of gender bias is the expressed belief that women are better workers because they are more careful, diligent, honest, hard-working, and caring countered by the general conviction that these same traits undermined their claims for leadership. Along with the overall preference of all interviewees for male bosses, women bosses were repeatedly criticized as too careful, too diligent, too honest, too emotional and not logical to make good leaders.

Although interviewees insisted that gender is not a factor in the workplace, they criticized women workers for their behavioral differences from men, differences that are assigned on the basis of gender. Owing to the strength of the gender system, interviewees attributed women's general lack of success and equity to individual shortcomings rather than systemic barriers.

The gender barriers that constrain women's participation in top decision-making positions can be organized into three categories: (1) *administrative/organizational* barriers, including selection and recruitment procedures, a male organizational culture, access to career-building opportunities, the gender division of labor, occupational segregation, and mentoring networks;

(2) *internal/interpersonal* barriers, including educational and technical skills; experience, self-confidence, motivation, ambition, and leadership attributes; and (3) *social/cultural* barriers, including socialization, culture, religion, the family, and individual social support, and the gendered nature of the public bureaucracy itself. The foremost social barrier is the dual work

burden, which assigns the primary responsibility for the care and well-being of the home and family to women.

### Conclusion

The study of women's position in the Indonesian public



Rapid growth of Jakarta is creating a formidable challenge to public administration

bureaucracy demonstrates that women must work harder and perform better than their male colleagues to earn equal consideration. The research identifies an organizational culture with two distinct personnel systems: the rational, objective merit-based system for women, alongside the subjective affirmative-action system of personal relationships for men. The findings add up to a gender-biased and stratified system, one that is lacking imperatives for change on the false assumption that equality has already been attained, the rejection of true equality for women in the highest leadership positions, and the refusal to recognize any benefits to such gender equality. Perhaps the greatest barriers to women's advancement into the top bureaucratic positions in Indonesia involve the lack of awareness of existing gender inequality, the lack of consideration for the possibility of gender equality, a blatant refusal to recognize any social benefits accruing from gender equality in decision-making positions, and clear gender contradictions present in all respondents' avowals compared with their descriptions of reality. The data show that respondents are not aware of their gendered characterizations, the underlying contradiction in claiming that women have equality while simultaneously describing their subordination to men, and the inherent sexism of this system.

The key remaining question concerns how this gender inequity can be changed; or, how greater gender equity can be sustained. Despite the lack of imperatives for change, the answer to this question lies with the same barriers that both maintain the exclusion of women from senior positions in the Indonesian public bureaucracy and ensure the entitlements of men. This research indicates some barriers that serve to maintain the status quo; they are also the same key targets to change in order to bring about greater gender equity. This study shows that the gender division of labor within the public bureaucracy,

which entails gender differentiation, stereotypes, and stratification, is primarily based on the dual work burden assigned to women. The dual work burden is a primary factor affecting women's position in the public bureaucracy by affecting their image and advancement possibilities, their relationship to men, and their working conditions in comparison to those of men. The dual work burden serves to both exclude women from positions of power, authority, and decision-making in the public bureaucracy and provide the rationale for such exclusion.

### Selected Bibliography

- Lembaga Administrasi Negara (The National Institute of Public Administration). (1981/1982). *Laporan Akhir Penelitian Peningkatan Peranan Pegawai Negeri Wanita Dalam Pembangunan* [A final research report on the enhancement of the role of female civil servants in development]. Jakarta: Republic of Indonesia, The National Institute of Public Administration.
- Licuanan, V. S. (Ed.). (1992). *Beyond Profit: Asean Women Managers in Government and Not-for-profit Organizations*. (Women Managers in Organizations Program). A joint project of the Asian Institute of Management and the Canadian International Development Agency. Manila, Philippines: Asian Institute of Management.
- Logsdon, M. G. (1985). Women civil servants in Indonesia: Some preliminary observations. *Prisma: the Indonesian Indicator*, 37, 77-87.
- Mohanty, C. T., Russo, A., & Torres, L. (Eds.). (1991). *Third World Women And The Politics of Feminism*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press.
- Silver, I. D. (1994). Women in development: Indonesia as a case study. (Section on International and Comparative Administration. Occasional Paper Series). American Society for Public Administration.
- Sullivan, N. (1994). *Masters and Managers: a Study of Gender Relations in Urban Java* (Women in Asia Publication Series). St. Leonards, Australia: Allen & Unwin.
- Wright, L., & Tellei, V. C. (1993). Women in management in Indonesia. *International Studies of Management & Organization*, 23(4), 19-41.

Dale Silver is currently a Coordinator for International Projects, International Programs and Studies at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. The above article was drawn from her December 1998 dissertation conducted under the Center for Public Policy and Administration Program, Virginia Commonwealth University. The research was carried out during her three years of living in Indonesia. The topic evolved from participation in a doctoral program that, at that time, did not include women in the field of study. Questions about the study can be directed to Dr. Silver at [isilver@uiuc.edu](mailto:isilver@uiuc.edu).



### \*\*\*\*\* GRANTS

**Travel Grants for International Women Graduate Students to Attend the AAEA Annual Meeting in Nashville, TN.** The AAEA Foundation Board has approved a \$2,000 grant to CWAE to help international women graduate students attend the 1999 AAEA annual meeting in Nashville. Grants ranging from \$300-\$400 will be made to approximately six international women graduate students who have completed two or more years of study towards a Ph.D. in Agricultural, Resource, or Applied Economics at a U.S. or Canadian University, to help defray the costs of attending the meeting. Send a brief statement (no more than one page) explaining why they want to attend the

meetings, what they expect to gain from the meetings, and their need for assistance (including other sources of funding to attend the meetings). The applicant should also note if she will be participating in the meetings in any other way (e.g. paper, poster, symposium, etc). The applicant's advisor should also include a brief letter of support confirming the applicant's eligibility and explaining why the student should attend the meetings and why the student needs our support. Applicants should be sent to: Janet Perry, CWAE Chairperson, Economic Research Service, 1800 M St., NW, Washington, D.C. 20036-5831. The application deadline is June 15 and applicants will be notified of their status by June 29.

\*\*\*\*\*

### WORKSHOPS/CONFERENCES

**WID Office Symposium Fall 1999: Women Organizing for Advancement in International Development, Oct. 8-10, 1999, at UI.** Contact the WID Office for more information. Also mark your calendars: **Symposium 2000: Where has WID Been? Where is WID Going?** October 20-22, 2000.

**Participatory Development: Concepts, Tools and Application in Participatory Rural/Rapid Appraisal (PRA), June 21-26, 1999 or July 19-24, 1999.** A workshop designed for international development practitioners, NGOs, participatory action researchers and educators, policy, program and project officers, and community activists. Organized by Mosaic.net International and the Praxis Group in Ottawa, Canada. For registration and other workshop information contact Mosaic.net International, Inc., 705 Roosevelt Ave., Ottawa, Canada K2A 2A8; Tel: (613) 728-1439 ext.1; Fax: (613) 728-1154; E-mail: [workshop@mosaic-net-intl.ca](mailto:workshop@mosaic-net-intl.ca)

**Feminist Economics: A Special Issue on Globalization.** Feminist Economics invites submissions of papers, short discussions and book reviews for a special issue on globalization to be published in 2000. The deadline for submission of papers is June 15, 1999. The guest editors for the issue are Lourdes Beneria ([lb21@cornell.edu](mailto:lb21@cornell.edu)), Maria Floro ([mfloro@American.edu](mailto:mfloro@American.edu)), Caren Grown ([CGrown@macfdn.org](mailto:CGrown@macfdn.org)), and Martha MacDonald ([Martha.MacDonald@smarys.ca](mailto:Martha.MacDonald@smarys.ca)). For guidelines check the journal's web page at <http://www.ruf.rice.edu/~femec/> or contact the editorial office Tel: 713-527-4083; fax: 713-285-5495; email [morehc@rice.edu](mailto:morehc@rice.edu). For more information, contact one of the guest-editors or Diana Strassmann ([dls@rice.edu](mailto:dls@rice.edu)).

**Housing, Work and Development: the Role of Home-based Enterprises--The CARDO International Conference on 26-28 April 2000, Newcastle upon Tyne, UK.** Some of the proposed topics include: Employment policy and the encouragement of home-based enterprises; Housing policy related to



home-based enterprises; The effect of environmental upgrading on home-based enterprises; Rental housing as income generation; Economic contribution of home-based enterprises at personal, household, neighbourhood, city and national level. Abstracts of 500 words should be submitted to Ms Justine Coulson (J.A.Coulson@ncl.ac.uk) at CARDO by **June 1, 1999**. A hard copy and either an email or diskette copy in Word for Windows 2, Word 6 or Wordperfect 5 should be also sent. Those who have submitted abstracts by that date will be notified of their acceptance by 2nd August, 1999. For inquiries regarding abstracts, contact Ms Coulson either by email or phone (0191 222 5686). The conference flyer complete with booking details can be sent either by post or email. To request a copy email: S.J.Lane@ncl.ac.uk. Alternatively, visit the CARDO website at <http://sharkie.csir.co.za/hbe>

**Women Mean Business: A Global Exchange**, a national Lessons Without Borders conference on Mentoring and Marketing for Women Entrepreneurs, sponsored by the U.S. Agency for International Development will be held in Chicago, Illinois at the Westin River North Hotel, June 2-3, 1999. Microenterprise and small business owners from the U.S. and abroad will share experiences and learn new techniques to support expansion of their businesses. For more information, contact: email: [lessons@usaid.gov](mailto:lessons@usaid.gov), fax: (202) 216-3034, phone: (202) 712-0072.



The WID Research Room (323 ISB) now has a detailed index directory of books and periodicals available in our collection, thanks to the work of Research Assistant, Silva Dushku.

\*\*\*\*\*

**JOB OPPORTUNITIES**

**OPPORTUNITIES WITH CONSULTATIVE GROUP ON INTERNATIONAL AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH (CGIAR)**

**IFPRI Postdoctoral Fellow, Uganda:** The Environment and Production Technology Division of International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) seeks an economist to serve as a Postdoctoral Fellow for two years to help lead policy research on policies to improve land management in Uganda. To apply, send a detailed letter of interest summarizing the relevance of

your experience to IFPRI's needs, curriculum vitae, and the names of at least three references to: IFPRI, Human Resource Services, Ref: 98-140 & Code GP, 2033 K St., NW, Washington, DC 20006, USA. Fax (202) 467-4439. Email for more info: [A.Howard@cgiar.org](mailto:A.Howard@cgiar.org). Position will remain open until a qualified candidate is identified.

**Director, Communications Division, The International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI)** is seeking an experienced senior manager to develop and implement institute wide strategies to: (1) disseminate IFPRI's research products; (2) support communications and capacity strengthening efforts by research and outreach divisions; and (3) strengthen IFPRI's capacity to target science-based food policy information through forms and media techniques that are attractive to its diverse stakeholder group. IFPRI's stakeholders include national policy makers, advisers and researchers in developing countries, regional and international organizations, donor organizations, NGOs and the public. To apply, send a detailed letter of interest summarizing the relevance of your experience to IFPRI's needs, curriculum vitae, and the names of at least three references to: IFPRI, Human Resource Services, 2033 K St., NW, Washington, DC 20006, USA. Fax 202/467-4439. Email: [A.Howard@cgiar.org](mailto:A.Howard@cgiar.org). Position will remain open until a qualified candidate is identified. Please refer to Code GP.

\*\*\*\*\*



A  
B  
O  
U  
T  
U  
S

Kathy Martin has been the secretary/office manager of the WID Office for nine years. In addition to her general office duties, she especially enjoys working on graphics and layout for WID announcements, copy editing and coordinating the production of the newsletters, planning receptions and conferences, and developing friendships with many students and international scholars associated with the Office. Kathy is a native of Illinois; she grew up on a local farm in Champaign County, has a BA degree in English, three daughters, and loves flower gardening, hiking with her family, reading, and relaxing in her hammock.

**WID SYMPOSIUM 1999: Microenterprise, NGOs, and the Environment, March 26-27, 1999**

WID Director, Gale Summerfield, and Associate Provost, Earl Kellogg, opened the Symposium. Keynote speaker, Jane Jaquette, talked on NGOs and the Broader Security Agenda.

(Summaries of the panels will appear in the September issue of the newsletter.)



Participants, left to right: 1. Earl Kellogg, Gale Summerfield; 2. Jane Jaquette; 3. Nahid Aslanbeigui, Gale Summerfield; 4. Cathy Rakowski, Jean Davison, Mai Barro, Nahid Aslanbeigui, Consolata Kabonesa; 5. Steve Pressman, Rae Lesser Blumberg, Rosintan Panjaitan; 6. Barbara Thomas-Slayter, Flora Makundi, Kathleen Cloud; 7. Rae Lesser Blumberg, Jane Jaquette; 8. Beth Stafford; 9. Vrinda Deva, Carmen Vergara, Barbara Thomas-Slayter, Rosintan Panjaitan.